

## YORK CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

### MINUTES

#### of the Inaugural Board Meeting in 2023

Wednesday, November 22, 2023 at the Catholic Education Centre, 320 Bloomington Road W, Aurora, Ontario

#### **PRESENT:**

##### Members:

##### **Trustees for the Term 2022 – 2026**

Elizabeth Crowe, Trustee for Aurora, King and Whitchurch-Stouffville  
 Theresa McNicol, Trustee for East Gwillimbury, Georgina and Newmarket (Virtual)  
 Carol Cotton, Trustee for Markham Area 1: Wards 1,2,3, 6  
 Frank Alexander, Trustee for Markham Area 2: Wards 4,5,7,8  
 Maria Iafrate, Trustee for Richmond Hill  
 Joseph DiMeo, Trustee for Richmond Hill  
 Angela Saggese, Trustee for Vaughan Area 1: Ward 1  
 Michaela Barbieri, Trustee for Vaughan Area 2: Ward 2 (Virtual)  
 Angela Grella, Trustee for Vaughan Area 3: Wards 3,4,5  
 Jennifer Wigston, Trustee for Vaughan Area 3: Ward 3,4,5

##### Student Trustees:

Jonah James, Senior Student Trustee (Absent with Notice)  
 Amira Zamanifar, Senior Student Trustee (Virtual)  
 Monica Galstyan, Junior Student Trustee (Virtual)

##### Administration:

D. Scuglia, J. Sarna, R. Antunes, A. Arcadi, A. Battick, M. Brosens,  
 D. Candido, J. Chiutsi, K. Elgharbawy, T. Laliberte, C. McNeil, S. Morrow,  
 B. Pageau, L. Paonessa, T. Pechkovsky, L. Sawicky, S. Wright

##### Legal Counsel:

Gillian Tuck-Kutarna, Miller Thomson LLP (5:00 pm to 5:10 pm)  
 Melissa Eldridge, BLG (5:00 pm to 5:43 pm)

##### Absent with Notice:

Jonah James, Senior Student Trustee

##### Recording Officer:

S. Greco

#### **Presiding:**

**Domenic Scuglia, Director of Education and Secretary of the Board for the Election of the Chair of the Board of the Board.**

#### **2024:010 CALL TO ORDER**

The Secretary of the Board opened the Inaugural (Part Two) Meeting of the Board at 5:00 pm..  
 The Opening Prayer and Land Acknowledgement was recited.

#### **2024:011 ROLL CALL / INTRODUCTION OF TRUSTEES FOR THE 2022-2026 TERM**

- Elizabeth Crowe, Trustee for Aurora, King and Whitchurch-Stouffville
- Theresa McNicol, Trustee for East Gwillimbury, Georgina and Newmarket (Virtual)
- Carol Cotton, Trustee for Markham Area 1: Wards 1,2,3, 6
- Frank Alexander, Trustee for Markham Area 2: Wards 4,5,7,8
- Maria Iafrate, Trustee for Richmond Hill
- Joseph DiMeo, Trustee for Richmond Hill
- Angela Saggese, Trustee for Vaughan Area 1: Ward 1
- Michaela Barbieri, Trustee for Vaughan Area 2: Ward 2 (Virtual)
- Angela Grella, Trustee for Vaughan Area 3: Wards 3,4,5
- Jennifer Wigston, Trustee for Vaughan Area 3: Ward 3,4,5
- Jonah James, Senior Student Trustee (Absent with Notice)
- Amira Zamanifar, Senior Student Trustee (Virtual)
- Monica Galstyan, Junior Student Trustee (Virtual)

**2024:012 DIRECTOR'S COMMENTS**

Director Scuglia started by acknowledging the error in electing the YCDSB Board Chair at the November 20, 2023, Inaugural Board Meeting and invited the appointed parliamentarian, Gillian Tuck-Kutarna, to offer her explanation.

Gillian Tuck-Kutarna remarked as follows:

*“Thank you very much, Director, and thank you all for the opportunity to address you tonight. As the Director said, I made an inadvertent error in calculating the votes that were cast on Monday night. And so I wanted to apologize to you privately on Monday night. I appreciate the chance to do so publicly tonight and to particularly apologize for the stress and inconvenience that were caused by the error and especially to the candidates involved. It's a stressful experience to put your name forward as a candidate for a leadership role. And I appreciate you doing that. Again, I'm sorry for my role in making that any more stressful than it had to be. In particular, I just wanted to clarify publicly that it was my error and not anything that the Board of Trustees were responsible for. I know that you've made considerable efforts over the years to ensure that your process is fair and that it's not only fair to the candidates, but seen to be fair. It was to that end that you decided to email your votes as a way of making sure that your process was beyond reproach. Unfortunately, in my case, it was not beyond human error. My apologies again for my part in that. Thank you for the opportunity to express that to you tonight.”*

Director Scuglia thanked Ms. Tuck-Kutarna and reiterated that the error resulted from a third-party agency outside of the York Catholic District School Board. The Trustees and Senior Administration want to reassure the public that they can continue to have complete confidence in how the election was conducted. As a result of Monday, staff have reviewed the process again and made changes to ensure what transpired is not repeated. We apologize for any inconvenience and confusion caused by the error.

**2024:013 ELECTION OF OFFICERS FOR YEAR 2023-2024**

*“We will now turn our attention to the task of electing our Board Chair for 2023-2024. Our Operating By-Law #1, Section 2, states that the Director of Education shall preside until the election of the Board Chair.*

*The following are the procedures for election:*

- *A seconder is NOT required for nomination.*
- *Trustees joining the meeting remotely will be permitted to be nominated as Chair.*
- *Trustees joining the meeting remotely may participate in the secret ballot process.*
- *All nominees will be permitted to address the Board members before voting commences for a maximum of two minutes each.*
- *All nominators will be permitted to introduce the nominee for a maximum of one minute.*
- *Election shall require a clear majority of the votes cast.*
- *Votes will be emailed to the Board's legal counsel who has joined the meeting to oversee the voting process. (Welcome to our Legal Counsel, Melissa Eldridge)*
- *In the event of three or more candidates, the candidate receiving the lowest number of votes will be eliminated, and another vote will be held until there is a clear majority.*
- *In the event that there are three or more candidates – and after the vote there is still no clear majority - but there is a tie between the candidates receiving the lowest vote -- so that no candidate can be eliminated -- a second vote by ballot will be held.*
- *If there is still a tie after that vote, I will draw lots between the candidates who have a tie vote, and the candidate whose name is drawn will be eliminated.*
- *In the event of two candidates and after the vote there is no clear majority, a second vote by ballot will be held.*
- *If there is still a tie after that vote, I will draw lots between the candidates that have a tie vote, and the candidate whose name is drawn will be eliminated.*

**a) Election of Chair of the Board**

The Director called for nominations for the office of Chair of the Board.

Nominations:

- i) Jennifer Wigston nominated Elizabeth Crowe.  
Elizabeth Crowe accepted the nomination.
  
- ii) Joseph DiMeo nominated Frank Alexander.  
Frank Alexander accepted the nomination.

The Director repeated the call for nominations for Chair of the Board thrice. Nominations for Chair of the Board were closed on **Motion by Cotton/DiMeo** and **CARRIED**.

Vice-Chair Iafrate asked the Director to ask Ms. Gillian Tuck Kutarna to disconnect from the meeting to ensure no confusion.

Gillian Tuck-Kutarna disconnected at 5:10 pm

D. Scuglia, Director of Education, invited each candidate to address the Board of Trustees for a maximum of two minutes before voting commenced.  
\*See Appendix A for nominees' remarks".

The Board of Trustees emailed Legal Counsel directly with their vote.

The vote resulted in a tie. Therefore, a second casting of vote was submitted electronically to the Board's Legal Counsel.

The second vote resulted in a tie. Therefore, as per 2.2(c)(i) of the Board's Operating By-Law, a vote was held by drawing lots. The ballot was drawn in clear view of all present including legal counsel that had joined virtually. Trustee Alexander's name was drawn from the box and therefore he was eliminated.

**The Director declared Elizabeth Crowe, Chair of the York Catholic District School Board for the year 2023-2024.**

Director Scuglia recognized outgoing Chair Frank Alexander for his hard work over the last year and his leadership, his passion for Catholic education, and his servant leadership to the Board. Director Scuglia wished Trustee Frank Alexander continued success as Trustee for the Board.

**Presiding: Elizabeth Crowe, Newly Elected Chair of the Board**

**2024:014 APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

*Add: TRUSTEE MOTION: Requesting a Police Investigation (F. Alexander)*

Trustee Alexander asked his fellow Trustees for their support to expedite his Motion to Action.

**MOTION: Wigston/DiMeo**

**THAT** the agenda be approved as amended.

- **MOTION CARRIED** -

**2024:015 ACTION ITEM(S):****a) TRUSTEE APPOINTMENTS TO COMMITTEES**

Chair E. Crowe proposed the appointments to Board Committees for the year November 2023 to November 2024 as follows:

**STANDING COMMITTEES****MOTION: Saggese/Cotton (ON BLOCK)**

**THAT** the Trustee appointments to the Standing Committees for the year November 2023 to November 2024 be as follows:

- a) **Corporate Services** - All Trustees
- b) **Executive Committee** (*Chair of the Board, Vice-Chair of the Board and 1 Trustee*)  
Chair, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese
- c) **Human Resources Committee** (*5 Trustees*)  
F. Alexander, M. Barbieri, E. Crowe, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese
- d) **Joint Board Consortium Committee** (*Chair of the Board and 2 Trustees*)  
Chair, J. DiMeo, A. Grella
- e) **Policy Review Committee** (*7 Trustees*)  
F. Alexander, M. Barbieri, C. Cotton, A. Grella, J. DiMeo, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese
- f) **Student Success & Pathways Committee** (*5 Trustees*)  
F. Alexander, M. Barbieri, J. DiMeo, A. Grella, A. Saggese
- g) **Surplus Asset Review Committee** (*3 Trustees*)  
E. Crowe, J. DiMeo, J. Wigston

**STATUTORY COMMITTEES**

**THAT** the Trustee appointments to the Statutory Committees for the year November 2023 to November 2024 be as follows:

- a) **Audit Committee** (*3 Trustees*)  
C. Cotton, J. DiMeo, M. Iafrate
- b) **Board Safe Schools Committee** (*3 Trustees and 1 Alternate*)  
A. Grella, A. Saggese, J. Wigston  
Alternate Member: M. Barbieri
- c) **Special Education Advisory Committee – 4 Year Term** (*2 Trustees and 1 Alternate*)  
A. Grella, J. Wigston  
Alternate Member: M. Barbieri
- d) **Supervised Alternative Learning for Excused Pupils** (*1 Trustee and 1 Alternate*)  
J. Wigston  
Alternate Member: E. Crowe
- e) **York Catholic Parent Involvement Committee** (*2 Trustees*)  
F. Alexander, M. Iafrate  
Alternate Member: A. Saggese

**TRUSTEE AD-HOC COMMITTEE**

**THAT** the Trustee appointments to the Trustee Ad-Hoc Committee for the year November 2023 to November 2024 be as follows:

- a) **International Language Extended Day Committee (3 Trustees)**  
J. DiMeo, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese (serve for the duration of the Ad-Hoc Committee)
- b) **York Catholic District School Board (YCDSB) Charitable Foundation**  
M. Barbieri, E. Crowe J. Wigston (serve for the duration of the Ad-Hoc Committee)
- c) **Transportation Review Committee**  
E. Crowe, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese

**STAFF COMMITTEE**

**THAT** the Trustee appointments to the Staff Committee for the year November 2023 to November 2024 be as follows:

- a) **Mental Health Advisory Group: 4 Year Term**  
A. Saggese, J. Wigston
- b) **Religious Education Advisory Committee**  
C. Cotton (until June 2024 as per Terms of Reference)
- c) **Toronto and Region Conservation Authority (TRCA) Natural Science & Education Committee: 4 Year Term**  
A. Grella
- d) **YCDSB Accessibility Committee: 4 Year Term**  
J. Wigston
- e) **YCDSB Archives Committee**  
E. Crowe, M. Iafrate, A. Saggese, J. Wigston (serve for the duration of the Staff Committee)
- f) **YCDSB Gender, Sexuality and Catholic Education: (3 Trustees)**  
M. Iafrate, A. Saggese J. Wigston (serve for the duration of the Staff Committee)

- **MOTION CARRIED** -

**b) TRUSTEE MOTION: Requesting a Police Investigation into the November 20, 2023 Election Process to Elect a Chair of the Board at York Catholic District School Board (F. Alexander)**

**MOTION: Alexander/Iafrate**

**THAT** the Board authorize the Chair to write a letter to the York Regional Police requesting that they launch an investigation into the conduct of the election process held on Monday, November 20, 2023 to determine whether there was any misfeasance committed in the process.

- **MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED** -

**2024:016      ADJOURNMENT: 5:43 P.M.**  
**ON MOTION: Saggese/DiMeo and CARRIED**

---

Secretary of the Board

---

Chair of the Board